THE COUNTY COUNCIL OF THE CITY & COUNTY OF CARDIFF

The County Council of the City & County of Cardiff met at County Hall, Cardiff on 26 January 2023 to transact the business set out in the Council summons dated Friday, 20 January 2023.

Present: County Councillor Hinchey (Lord Mayor)

County Councillors Ahmed, Ahmed, Dilwar Ali, Ash-Edwards, Berman, Boes, Bradbury, Bridgeman, Brown-Reckless, Burke, Carr, Carter, Chowdhury, Cowan, Cunnah, Davies, De'Ath, Derbyshire, Driscoll, Ebrahim, Elsmore, Ferguson-Thorne, Gunter, Gibson. Goodway, Green, Henshaw, Humphreys, Hunt, Jenkins, Jones, K Jones, Owen Jones, Joyce, Kaaba, Lancaster, Latif, Lay, Lent, Lewis, Lister, Littlechild, Livesy, Lloyd Jones, Mackie, McEvoy, McGarry, Melbourne, Merry, Michael, Molik, Moultrie, Naughton, Owen, Palmer, Jackie Parry, Reid-Jones, Robinson, Robson, Sangani, Shimmin. Simmons, Singh, Stubbs. Huw Thomas, Thomson, Lynda Thorne, Waldron, Weaver, Wild, Williams, Wong and Wood

1 : APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

Apologies for absence were received from Councillors Bowen-Thomas. Councillor Joel Williams will be late in attending the meeting.

2 : DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

No declarations of interest were received.

3 : MINUTES

The minutes of the Council Meeting held on the 24 November 2022 and the Extraordinary Council meeting held on the 9 December 2022 were approved as a correct record and signed by the Lord Mayor.

4 : PUBLIC QUESTIONS

Howard Kilvington to Cllr De'Ath, Cabinet Member for Transport and Strategic Planning

Can the Cabinet Member for Transport and Strategic Planning offer any improvement in the buses' frequency and routes from Thornhill to the city centre, by reinstatement of the bus service via Lake Road West and Mackintosh Place scrapped in 2019. The service was lost in favour of combination with an existing route via Lakeside and Wellfield Road and Albany Road; and a 50% timetable reduction that results in change is a great inconvenience to residents of a substantial area and possible switch to car use

Reply - Cllr De'Ath

Mr Kilvington, welcome to Cardiff Council. I've said before in this Chamber, I sympathise with people living in areas like Cyncoed, with people in the north of the city, with people in areas of the west. The bus service needs to be better and more reliable, and I actually appreciate why you want to ask me questions about the municipal bus service. However, whilst Cardiff Council is the shareholder of Cardiff Bus, it's a private company. I have no say in its routes or how it operates. There are in fact laws in place to stop councils controlling bus services. The reason why the company made the decision you outline in 2019 is that route wasn't commercially viable, and they had to recombine it in a way that is more financially sustainable. As a local authority we've got very, very limited amount of funding to subsidise socially necessary routes; that's fully committed going forward. Bus service levels still haven't returned to their pre-pandemic levels. The service is being subsidised very heavily by Welsh Government. It's very unclear what funding will be in place post-March. It's a really difficult time for the bus industry in general, so I'm sure that's not the answer you were hoping for, but that's an honest appraisal of the situation in which we find ourselves.

Supplementary question – Mr Kilvington

We understand that Cardiff Council has aspirations to be an Age Friendly City; so does the Cabinet Member not agree that encouraging residents to see the bus service as the first option for getting around the city to where they want to be quickly and on time, in accordance with the Public Transport for Wales Bill, should be a priority? At the moment, in key parts of Lake Road West, Macintosh Place and Shirley Road, as well as parts of Cyncoed and Celyn Avenue on Lakeside, there is no bus service available, which is a problem for our older neighbours, particularly those who have no other way of getting around. A local group has been fervent in contacting Cardiff Bus management and the Cardiff City executives about this situation, as well as holding a meeting in a local church hall, which attracted over 130 residents...

Reply - Cllr De'Ath

Thank you, Lord Mayor. I don't disagree with you Mr Kilvington, but two things need to happen to improve bus services in Cardiff. One: the Welsh Government is bringing forward re-regulation legislation at the end of this year, which will give us some control over how the bus services are shaped. And two: we need more money to get more services, more frequency. We've outlined a number of options in our Transport White Paper, and I very much hope your local councillors will support those moves when they come forward. Thank you.

Adam Johannes to Councillor Thorne, Cabinet Member for Housing and Communities

In 2018-19, almost 91,000 Cardiff residents, around one quarter of our city's population, borrowed an item from a city library. If libraries are invested in and not cut, they remain one of the most used, most loved, most popular public services. Evidence from elsewhere in the UK suggests that cutting opening times and a diminished service often leads to residents using their libraries less. Has the Council done any research to assess the potential impact on library usage figures if opening times are cut? Conversely, has the Council explored the benefits to residents if library opening times were increased; for example, opening in the evenings?

Reply – Cllr Thorne

Thank you, Mr Johannes, and thank you for your question. I completely appreciate the views that you've expressed in your question, and understand the positive impact that our hubs and libraries make to communities across Cardiff. Our hubs and libraries provide a full range of library provision as well as access to many Council and partner services, including: housing; benefits; money advice; Into Work services; learning opportunities; community events; youth services; and health and wellbeing initiatives. It is, however, unfortunately, a reality that the current budgetary position faced by the Council is extremely challenging.

The budget consultation remains live until this coming Sunday, and so no decisions have been made yet on which saving proposals will be implemented. The hubs and library service monitors both footfall and book issue figures across our 21 hubs and libraries; and a balanced, evidence-based approach will be adopted should it be necessary to reduce opening times. Every effort will be made to mitigate any negative impact on our services.

Most of our hubs and libraries are already open until 7pm one day a week, to offer flexibility to our customers. There are no plans to change this, and there is no evidence to show that there is a requirement to do more. I welcome your feedback, which will be taken into consideration prior to the final decision being made following the conclusion of the public consultation.

Supplementary question – Mr Johannes

Without the education I gave myself at a public library, I think there's no way someone like be from such a poor and shabby background would have the courage and confidence to ask a question in front of such powerful men and women of the city. But we know that libraries are not just buildings or books; they're are also librarians and professional trained library staff, and when I speak to library staff they're increasingly concerned by the introduction of unpaid volunteers in ever increasing numbers into our library service; and they feel that the Council doesn't really understand or value the role that they do. I mean, we know that in 2019, a library worker took his own life after his talk by the Council... I would just like Councillor Lynda Thorne to give her view of what a library worker does; because I think that if she understands that, there will be no way that she would want our public service to be delivered by unpaid labour.

Reply – Cllr Thorne

Thank you, Mr Johannes. I can tell you that Cardiff has the best library attendance figures in Wales; and despite 12 years of austerity, not a single library has closed. There were 21 and libraries and we still have 21 libraries, thanks to our innovative approach to providing the service in Cardiff. And although book lending hasn't increased since the format of library service provision changed to using hubs and libraries; however, we have increased our active members during that time. There's also been a shift in demand into digital formats during the last four years with an 186% increase; and our digital provision has also attracted a much greater audience reach, supporting 22% increase in our active borrowers. We really do understand, and I do, the importance of the library service, and I believe that we are reaching more people than ever before; and many of the services that we put on, such as the children's book reading event which takes place during the school

holidays, is really important to introduce books to young people. And so I hope you can see that actually our service, compared with the rest of Wales, is amazing. Had it not been probably for austerity, maybe we wouldn't have changed. But I think the change has been a change for the better, encouraging more and more people into our hubs who also access the library service at the same time.

Florian French to Councillor Burke-Davies, Cabinet Member for Culture, Parks and Events

The flooding of the Taff recently has left lots of rubbish along the riverbanks and stuck in trees. What is the Council going to do to clean this up?

Reply - Cllr Burke-Davies

Thank you for your question Florian, and I hope that you've been made to feel very welcome here today. From late December last year through to the middle of this month we saw several large weather fronts, bringing windy conditions and significant levels of rainfall to Cardiff. This is not an uncommon occurrence and the UK is experiencing more extreme weather of this nature on a more frequent basis. Furthermore, due to the large catchment area of the River Taff, which extends to 526 square kilometres. Cardiff river flows are impacted by high rainfall events outside the city's boundaries, which results in debris being washed further down into our river corridors. River flows on the Taff are measured by Natural Resources Wales, in cumecs, and that's a cubic metre per second, with 1 cumec being equivalent to one tonne of water. By way of measure of the conditions experienced, the highest river flows were reached on the 12th of January at 494 cumecs, which is 494 tonnes per second; the second highest flow recorded since 2002. Such conditions result in overtopping the riverbanks, which is what happened recently in areas such as Bute Park, Pontcanna Fields and other areas of green space bordering the River Taff, including the Taff Trail. They also result in continuous levels of debris sweeping downriver into Cardiff, the majority of which ends up in the Bay. A debris boom is in situ on the River Taff in the vicinity of Channel View leisure centre in Grangetown, which captures the majority of debris that travels down the river and prevents it collecting in the Bay. However, during extremely high river flows, debris can pass the boom and collect, in and around the Bay, and on riverbanks. Clear-up operations have been ongoing since December, and the conditions experienced during the period from late December to mid-January, have generated an estimate of 210 tonnes of debris from the boom and Bay area alone, with approximately 50% of this volume being removed to date. To illustrate the scale of the challenge, the average annual volume of debris removed from these areas is 440 tonnes, so you can see there's a significant increase there. I anticipate that the clear-up operation will continue through mid-February of the Cardiff Bay area, our parklands and river corridors. The Council's efforts will be supported by our network of stakeholders, which include, but are not limited, to Cardiff Rivers Group and Keep Wales Tidy.

Supplementary question – Florian French

Most of the rubbish is caused by sewage overflows. What are you doing to prevent these in Cardiff? Why are you allowing a sewage pumping station on Hailey Park that will make the problem worse?

Reply - Cllr Burke-Davies

I can't answer the question specifically in regard to Hailey Park because of the ongoing judicial review. But in regard to what's being done; as I mentioned, we are working with partners. The Council itself is limited in what we can do; but we work with Natural Resources Wales; we work with our Keep Wales Tidy partners; Cardiff Rivers Group; and there's a piece of work as well there for the Welsh Government to take up as well.

Steph Wilkins to Cllr Sangani, Cabinet Member for Tackling Poverty, Equality and Public Health

I'm not sure how I'm going to follow Flori. Well done Flori. As a public sector organisation Cardiff Council is subject to the public sector equality duty; and in relation to Wales, the Equality and Human Rights Commission states, 'The PSED is being used to increase transparency and accountability, in particular the publication of equality impact assessments has assisted with holding public authorities to account for their decisions'. Cardiff Council is required not only to assess the impact of changes to its facilities and services, but is obliged to consult with users and user groups covered under the Equality Act 2010, and to also demonstrate that it has done so. How, when, where and whom to does Cardiff Council publish its assessments under the PSED and any equality impacts it undertakes, and what are the governance routes within the Council to Welsh Government and to the public for transparency?

Reply - Cllr Sangani

Cardiff Council is committed to equality and diversity, and takes seriously its obligation under the Public Sector Equality Duty. Equality impact assessments therefore form an important part of any policy or service change proposal developed by the Council. They help guard against any inadvertent discrimination and ensure that if any negative impacts are identified, mitigating action can be considered. This will include, where necessary, consultation with any affected groups where an equality impact assessment identifies a material impact on any of the protected characteristic demographic groups or specific service user. The equality impact assessment is then published as an appendix to any related report to Cabinet. All Cabinet reports are published at least 3 clear working days prior to public meeting of Cabinet and are accessible on Council's website.

Supplementary question – Ms Wilkins

I've been reading your Equality Inclusion Strategy 2020-24, and there's lots of good pieces in there; but it doesn't link into the wider consultation. So, for example, on our local park, there's been recent changes to it; we've got Scouts groups, and there's a local man that works with disadvantaged youths that actually use part of the park for training. That hasn't been captured because of the lack of consultation, and it's an opportunity that we miss, the equality and inclusion aspects of that. I found this on website which is all about democracy in Cardiff: contact your local Councillor, done that; attend public meetings, done that; download the Government app, done that; follow Cardiff Council on social media, done that; take part in consultations... My question is, despite doing petitions, public, and all this, why are you still building on our park?

Lord Mayor

I think that I could ask Cllr Sangani to respond, but it probably needs to go to a different Cabinet Member as it's slightly differently to the original question. Cllr Sangani, if you just want to...

Reply - Cllr Sangani

I just want to say the same thing. I am afraid I don't cover that as part of my portfolio. The Council's corporate property strategy was considered and approved by the Cabinet in December 2021, just before I was elected as a Councillor; and I understand that there was only one recommendation in the report published earlier this month, the Council should complete an equality impact assessment for the corporate property strategy. The Council has now completed an equality impact assessment for its corporate property strategy, and the property team have also received training from the Council's Equality Team on the public sector equality duty and on completing effective equality impact assessments.

Anita Smith to Cllr Burke-Davies. Cabinet Member for Culture. Parks and Events On the 3rd of October 2022 the Welsh Government published a video statement saying climate change has forced us to re-evaluate our relationship with nature. We all need to think about how we can make the best choices to benefit us now and in the future. The Minister for Climate Change, Julie James MS, went on to explain in a video statement the need to stop the decline in biodiversity in Wales and restart the recovery process, saying we need people to understand that we need to halt the reversal in biodiversity in Wales; every landowner in Wales, to think about what they are doing and to take on recommendations of the biodiversity deep dive, and understand what that means for them. She goes on to say, 'Behind me you'll see the beautiful meadow, you'll see the beautiful trees. What perhaps you don't see is a bit of scrubland with brambles and so on, which is just as important to the wildlife as all the beautiful bits.' We need to understand that bramble, nettle and untidiness is absolutely essential to make sure invertebrates that birds need to feed on survive. Obviously, it's for the big players to put a big effort into making sure their practices bring us back to nature. Can the Cabinet Member explain Cardiff Council's plans. including timetable, regarding the biodiversity deep dive, and how it intends to involve community groups, particularly friends groups; and will you commit to maintaining the existing scrubland on its parks?

Reply - Cllr Burke-Davies

Hello, Anita, it's nice to see you. I can confirm that the Council is currently engaging with the Welsh Government in support of the key themes and recommendations of the biodiversity deep-dive, which were published in October last year. The Council is reviewing the planning policy framework for the city as part of its ongoing preparations for the replacement Local Development Plan. This is timely as it presents the opportunity to consider these themes and recommendations as part of the preparation for the next stage, which is the preferred strategy, to be considered by Cabinet and Council, subject to consultation, later in the year. In addition to this, the Council is reviewing its biodiversity and resilience of ecosystems duty (BRED) action plan, and again it will be important for this review to consider the themes and recommendations of the Welsh Government's deep dive. As you'll be aware, the Council has a well-established network of friends and volunteer groups who we work closely with in promoting and enhancing the biodiversity. This includes the friends of Hailey Park, and I'm aware of how active you and your colleagues are, and the

significant contribution you have made over time to promoting and enhancing biodiversity. The Local Nature Partnership also plays a critical role in engaging stakeholders and taking action forwards; and I was particularly pleased that one of the recommendations of the biodiversity deep dive was about investing in and providing for local nature partnerships to support collaborative partnership action for nature recovery at a local level. The Council's existing networks will be used as a way of meeting the recommendation of building a strong foundation for future delivery through capacity building, behaviour change, awareness raising, and skills development. In this respect, and notwithstanding the challenges faced by the nature recovery agenda, I do believe that the Council has a strong position to embed the objectives that have been set and is, in principle, committed to maintain scrublands in our parks.

Supplementary question - Mrs Smith

Bearing in mind the evidence of wellbeing gains of connectedness to nature in an area like Llandaff North electoral ward, with high levels of multiple deprivation and risks of flooding, will and how will Cardiff Council work in partnership with friends of Hailey Park and local residents and parking users, to promote and invest so that Hailey Park can be made a candidate site for Nature Networks Programme. On this park we have an existing sink, prestigious Green Flag award and freshwater river corridor, linking it to other important green spaces that need protecting from developments like the sewage pumping station.

Reply – Cllr Burke-Davies

In as much as I have the ability to support in that capacity, then yes.

5 : PETITIONS

The following petitions were received:

Presented by	Number of Relevant Signatures	Nature of Petition
Cllr Emma Reid-Jones	52	Remove the 'Beaufort Gardens' 5G Masts on Lisvane Road, Cardiff
Cllr Andrea Gibson	108	Objecting to the Tree Preservation Order 22/02949/WTTPP and requesting the dangerous path be removed (Woodland adjoining Maind Road, Gwaelod-Y-Garth

6 : LORD MAYOR'S ANNOUNCEMENTS

Since the last Council meeting in early December, the Lady Mayoress and I have attended many Christmas events across the City, from Tongwynlais to the Norwegian Church in Cardiff Bay. We have also supported other Christmas charity events, such as City Hospice, Tenovus and the Emergency Services Annual Concert at Llandaff Cathedral.

We have also visited many schools, community groups and care homes throughout the month, all of which have been lovely events and we have been warmly welcomed. I'm becoming a real "knowledge buff" on "the Lord Mayoralty, the chains and history of Cardiff from 1868"

Other "stand out" visits, events and speaking engagements over the last few weeks were: The Cardiff Children's Services "Bright Sparks Awards" with Cllrs Ash Lister and Sarah Merry; Understanding Disability Awards; Cardiff & the Vale Youth Orchestra concert; World Aids Day Memorial at National Museum theatre; 4 British Citizenship Ceremonies (around 120 people), have been held here in the Council Chamber; Madina Mosque in Cathays with worshippers and Cllr Ali Ahmed; Opening of Cardiff Councils first Passivhaus low energy apartments and houses at Aspect Place, Heath. The Leader, Cllr Thorne and fellow local members, Cllrs Sangani and Ash Edwards gifted Christmas hampers to new families who had already moved in within days of completing the scheme.

Tomorrow is Holocaust Memorial Day, an international day of remembrance for victims of the Holocaust and other genocides. The day honours the survivors and remembers those who have lost their lives. It is held on January 27 every year, the anniversary of the liberation of Auschwitz.

This year, on advice from the Holocaust Memorial Trust and due to the significant increase in Covid, Flu and other winter virus, local events have been moved to virtual and pre-recorded messages and services. A YouTube message from the First Minister, Leader of Cardiff Council and myself Cardiff will be available from 11am tomorrow morning. Holocaust Memorial Day serves as a valuable reminder that acts of persecution, and acts of discrimination, are not only in the past but are also tragically still around us today. "Together, we must continue to challenge prejudice, stand up to hatred, and speak out against persecution."

And finally, I must formerly inform Council of the passing of one of our recent councillors and former Rt Hon Lord Mayor of Cardiff, Cllr Keith Hyde. Keith represented the Pentwyn Ward from 2004 to 2017 and was know as a hardworking local councillor. He was also longstanding and active member of the Cardiff Model Engineering Society based at Heath Park. An interest that he loved and shared with his wife Anne. Cllr Hyde was elected as Lord Mayor of Cardiff in 2010-11 and fulfilled many important engagements as Cardiff's First Citizen, including Royal visits and important City events.

I have known Keith's son Steve for many years but only served on these benches alongside Keith Hyde between 2012 to 2017, after which he retired. He was true servant of our City and a lovely man. I visited Keith's wife Anne at home this week and passed on our heartfelt condolences from this Chamber.

7 : STANDARDS AND ETHICS ANNUAL REPORT 2021- 2022

Jason Bartlett moved the report.

The report contained information on the work of the Standards & Ethics Committee during 2021-2022.

RESOLVED: The Council AGREED that the report be noted.

8 : CABINET STATEMENTS

Leader Statement

The Leader responded to guestions in relation to:

Levelling Up Fund

Housing & Communities Statement

Councillor Thorne responded to questions in relation to:

- House Building Programme
- Completion of Adams Court
- Community Living Schemes
- Damp and mould issues in Council Housing
- Rhiwbina hub
- Community Safety

Investment & Development Statement

Councillor Goodway responded to questions in relation to:

Economic Update

Social Services Statement

Councillor Mackie responded to guestions in relation to:

Hospital Discharge

Tackling Poverty, Equality & Public Health Statement

Councillor Sangani responded to questions in relation to:

- HIV Test Messaging services
- COVID-19 and Flu Vaccinations

Councillor Bradbury responded to questions in relation to:

• Into Work Advice Service – Support for the Over 50's

Transport & Strategic Planning Statement

Councillor De'Ath responded to questions in relation to:

- Highways Operations
- Cardiff Electric Bus Scheme Grant
- Cardiff Active Travel Network Map
- Houses in Multiple Occupation (HMOs)

Deputy Leader and Education Statement

Councillor Merry responded to questions in relation to:

- Strike Action
- School Attendance

Climate Change Statement

Councillor Wild responded to questions in relation to:

- Roath park Flood defences
- Flooding in smaller areas

- Drainage
- One Planet Cardiff

Culture, Parks & Events Statement - No questions

Finance, Modernisation & Performance Statement

Councillor Weaver responded to questions in relation to:

- Budget Consultation 2023/24 Provisional Settlement
- Local Broadband

9 : ORAL QUESTIONS

Councillor Williams to Councillor Merry

Children and young people in Pontprennau and Old St Mellons and across Cardiff are being forced to pay for bus travel to and from high school, despite living almost 3 miles away from these school. Currently pupils who live more than 3 miles away from their high school received subsidised public transport to school. Many families are unable to afford costly bus fares, forcing children and young people to spend up to 2 hours each day walking to and from school. I have recently been informed of a case where a young person over 16 and living over 3 miles from his catchment high school has to pay £380 a year to go to his catchment school on the school bus. This is one of many cases where families are facing costly bills. Will the Cabinet Member commit to reviewing the arrangements for subsidised public transport for children and young people to ensure pupil safety is prioritised and those pupils living just below the 3-mile threshold and ensure those accessing sixth form (and over 3 miles from their high school) are able to access subsidised public transport?

Reply – Cllr Merry

I would always advise Members with concerns about a particular constituent to contact me directly, so we can see that they have accessed all the help available. Many families have been impacted by the current cost of living crisis and the Council is overseeing the distribution of almost £2.2 million worth of grants to ease the burden on those households most in need. With all Council budgets under severe pressure at present, and increasing cost pressures within the existing mainstream and ALN home to school transport budget, the Council is committed to ensuring that its statutory requirements are fulfilled, and the people with the most need receive the specialist transport they require. I would remind Cllr Williams that currently we have a budget gap of £23 million, and any widening of provision to free transport would have to apply equally across the city and be sustainable over time. That's only fair to the families involved. The Welsh Government has set the distance criteria that statutory school age pupils need to satisfy to qualify for free transport, and those are the statutory distance criteria that the Council applies. The Welsh Government has started to explore whether these should be revised, and I would welcome that revision. I would also welcome any new provision for young people, under any wider consideration of transport in the city. I would add that I believe the UK Government has said that 3 miles is an appropriate distance for children above the ag4e of 8 to walk to school.

Supplementary Question - Cllr Williams

I'm sure many young people and their families will be disappointed in the response from the Deputy Leader of the Council. It simply doesn't wash for you to say we've got a budget gap of £23.5 million, yet we can then find an additional £100 million for the Cardiff Council so far behind the Russell Goodway conference centre at Cardiff Bay. It won't wash. So let's get to the supplementary. Why is it you will not commit to ensuring (Interruption)

Lord Mayor

Sit down Cllr Williams, a point of order has been called.

Point of order – Cllr Goodway

Is it in order for a Member of this Council to deliberately mislead Members?

Lord Mayor

Can we stick to the relevant question and the statement, rather than drift into economic development. Let's have a supplementary question.

Cllr Williams

Thank you Lord Mayor, I've been accused of misleading the Chamber, I'm happy to be corrected, on the reports, in the media, that Cardiff Council face an additional £100 million

Cllr Williams

Well, we've heard from the Cabinet Member of a budget shortfall of £23.5 million, in her answer, so what I want to know from the Cabinet Member is, why is it that when we've got millions of pounds for other projects, you will not commit to ensuring children and young people's safety, ensure our children and young people can get to school safely, thereby improving our attendance figures, which have not yet returned to the pre-Covid levels?

Reply – Cllr Merry

I was going to say the Member for the Opposition still doesn't understand the difference between revenue expenditure and capital expenditure. And I think it's a great shame actually, this is a very, very serious issue to be treated like this. Three miles is actually the distance that's been used for many years. You will always, if you have a threshold, have people who are just below that threshold. That is there by definition. Now actually, I agree that the Welsh Government should review that threshold; and I've also stated that I would like to see, when we are able to consider a wider review of transport, making sure the needs of young people are firmly on the agenda when we do that.

Cllr Berman to Cllr Burke

Given that the proposals being considered by the council's administration for St David's Hall would involve increasing the capacity of a venue designed to hold just under 2,000 people to up to 2,500 people; given that following the recent tragic incident at the Academy Music Group (AMG)-run O2 Brixton Academy when two people tragically died in a fatal crush in December, the Security Industry Authority has launched an inquiry into corruption claims at the venue (including claims that security guards had taken bribes to allow people who didn't have tickets inside); and

given that the London music venue's licence from Lambeth Council remains suspended following the December incident with this suspension having now been extended for a further three months: do you still feel that AMG is a suitable organisation to take on the running of our national concert hall?

Reply - Cllr Burke

The Council is aware of the ongoing investigation into the tragic events outside the O2 Brixton academy in December. AMG has 24 venues across the UK and the safety record is exemplary. The Academy Music Group is made up of three of the leading music event promoters and music venue operators of the world. They are responsible for delivering some of the biggest music events on the planet, with their combined venues and events managing up to 100 million visitors a year. The events at the Brixton Academy are very much isolated, based on the particular set of circumstances that are being properly investigated, with the investigation going beyond the venue operator and including the local police force. Of course, the incident does underline the importance of effective health and safety management, particularly when dealing with large crowds. Cardiff takes a strong partnership approach to event management, and this will continue with St David's Hall. The tragic events in London will no doubt sharpen the focus on ensuring the highest standards of health and safety provision are provided, maintained and monitored through AMG's custodianship of the venue.

Supplementary question – Cllr Berman

How can you say that their safety record is exemplary when we have an incident t where two people have tragically lost their lives? I suppose what I want to know is, what action has the Council done to look properly at whether AMG is a suitable organisation to be running St David's Hall, since these tragic events occurred? Can you give us some detail about how that has been examined, and what conclusions the Council has drawn?

Reply - Cllr Burke

The question you have raised is a valid one. I don't think this is the forum to do it in. I think, without wishing to teach you to suck eggs because you've been doing this job a lot longer than I have, you risk making this into a political football. There is an ongoing investigation - don't shake your head at me - two women lost their lives, there is an ongoing investigation. It would be inappropriate for me to comment at this point, until the facts are known. When the facts are known, we can have the conversations with AMG and make sure that appropriate measures are put in place for St David's. I really don't want this to turn into a political issue, because of what happened at the O2 Brixton Academy. But ss I said, they have 24 venues across the UK that haven't had these issues, so the set of circumstances that happened at Brixton Academy are very specific, and we have to know the detail around that, and I'm not going to comment on that further.

Cllr Livesy to Cllr Burke

The Museum of Cardiff must meet certain conditions in order to qualify for Museum Accreditation status – provided by a UK partnership scheme run by the Welsh Government Culture Division. These conditions include being a "permanent entity with a long-term purpose" and minimum levels of public access to exhibits. The Council's proposals threaten the museum's ability to meet these benchmarks and, in *This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg*

turn, raise money from charitable grants – which often require accreditation status. Essentially – how would any future mobile scheme be funded, and given the main concern is that examples of successful pop-up museums are hard to find, why is it being considered or proposed?

Reply – Cllr Burke

It's been established that we've received a better than expected increase in funding from the Welsh Government, with our deferred provisional statement, but we still need to find £23.5 million in order to balance the books. This is on top of a third of a billion pound budget gap that we've had to manage since 2010. Each year our options become less and less palatable. I will not dispute any of the sentiments you've expressed about Museum of Cardiff; however, we have faced hard choices, one of which would be to close the museum. We are striving to avoid that scenario; instead we are investigating the feasibility of other operating models which will allow the museum to operate at a lower cost. We have been grateful for all the advice and responses that we have received to date and as part of the ongoing budget consultation which doesn't close until Sunday. Once we have fully considered the options available to us we will conclude our deliberations and confirm the next steps.

Cllr Humphreys to Cllr Thomas

Whilst being grateful for the £50 million contribution from the UK Government that matches the £50 million already committed by Welsh Government for the Metro Line to Butetown, can the Leader give an update on our other three "Levelling Up" Bids?

Reply – Cllr Thomas

I share your excitement about the recent news on Levelling Up. I can confirm that there were two bids submitted for Round 2 of the Levelling Up Fund from Cardiff. The second one, for wider public realm and infrastructure in the wider Atlantic Wharf area; that was unsuccessful. We had previously submitted a bid in Round 1 to secure investment into Cardiff Market, which was also unsuccessful. So you can see that whilst we celebrate the significant success around the Crossrail bid, that it is a bit of a lottery. When you look at the picture elsewhere, particularly in England, perhaps the particular focus on south east England; you do begin to wonder whether there is some politics behind how Levelling Up Fund bids are awarded. In terms of the three bids submitted so far, that is the update.

Supplementary question – Cllr Humphreys

The proposed Youth Zone in my ward of Ely would be transformational for young people in Ely, Caerau and Fairwater, three areas with large pockets of deprivation. Given this is what the UK Government claims its Levelling Up is all about, what guarantees did the Secretary of State for Wales give that this project would be looked upon favourably?

Reply – Cllr Thomas

A very good question, Cllr Humprheys, because as you say the Youth Zone in Ely, which would serve a far wider area than just your local ward, is a project that we are proposing to put forward into the Levelling Up fund in the third round of funding. This is a significant project which would be of immense value to the young people of Ely, Fairwater, Caerau, and Cardiff West more widely. I'm joining some other councillors in a visit to a similar facility in London later this year to see how they operate there,

and alongside has been commissioned to develop a business case in anticipation of a third round of the Levelling Up fund. But again, I am struck, when you look at the councils awarded funding in Round 1, they weren't successful in securing funding in Round 2, even though they've been told, categorically, that they should bid for funds in Round 2. So I will be raising the matter with the Secretary of State for Wales, and I will be seeking guarantees that we will qualify and be in a position to be successful with a third round of bids. But I'm also very conscious that there are other councils that were successful in Round 1 that sought that advice, were given the advice to bid, and were not successful. So it underlines to me why the Levelling Up Fund is an imperfect system, and I look forward to it being reformed under a future UK Labour Government.

Cllr Robson to Cllr Thomas

Will the Leader comment on the process used to identify the Levelling Up Fund bid?

Reply - Cllr Thomas

With all these Levelling Up questions I'm starting to regret that we won. That's a joke. The initial proposals for submission to the Levelling Up Fund was approved by Cabinet on the 17th of June 2021, you will recall, and were then revised by Cabinet on 10th March last year. As outlined when these reports were presented in those meetings, one bid per Parliamentary constituency is allowed per round, and must be based on projects that deliver culture, transport regeneration and town centre investments. Details of the Round 2 Levelling Up Fund process can be found on the UK Government website, but the strategy that we were putting forward for our Levelling Up Fund bids was considered by Scrutiny at the time and supported at the time. So an iterative process that had the appropriate scrutiny around it.

Supplementary question - Cllr Robson

You mentioned in relation to a previous wquestion that there's politics involved in the Levelling Up Fund in your view. You may right. I'll tell you where the politics is: it's the fact the Conservative Government has actually invested £50 million in this Welsh capital city to build a key link in the Crossrail. You welcomed the announcement of this bid being successful. You were there at the photos which was absolutely fantastic, that we have this money coming into the city. The politics of it is that actually, in my opinion, the Welsh Government would never have delivered the £100 million on its own that you talked about, never in a million years, for the Cardiff capital; and would you agree that this Council still has a lot of work to do with the Welsh Government to avoid the anywhere but Cardiff approach that we see so often coming out of Cardiff Bay?

Reply – Cllr Thomas

I think you may well be correct Cllr Robson, that it would have been a struggle for us to have secured the entirety of that amount from Welsh Government, for the very simple reason that Welsh Government is being starved of capital funding by UK Government. And in particular, when we're talking about rail infrastructure, the obscene decision by the UK Tory Government to not award Barnett consequentials for the High Speed 2 project; a project that has been demonstrated to have a negative economic impact on Cardiff and south east Wales, and yet the UK Tory Government claims this is a project that will benefit Wales, even though it disbenefits

two-thirds of the population of Wales. That is £5 billion of Barnett consequentials that Wales is missing out on because of the decisions of your party.

Cllr Carter to Cllr De'Ath

In light of the closure of the Cardiff East Park and Ride to the city centre, is this Council still committed to a Greener Cardiff?

Reply - Cllr De'Ath

Absolutely Cllr Carter, and Park and Ride is still a really important part of the transport mix. We're continuing to support the successful use of the Cardiff East Park and Ride by people travelling to and from University Hospital Wales. The Park and Ride facility serving the city centre has been relocated to the Bay with the intention of encouraging greater use, in line with event day Park and Ride at County Hall which operates very successfully. In the longer term, there will be greater capacity for Park and Ride for those travelling to and from the city centre from the east through the use of the proposed Cardiff Parkway development.

Supplementary question – Cllr Carter

We often compare ourselves to other cities across the UK, but if you look elsewhere you'll struggle to find a modern city without a weekday, daytime Park and Ride. And yet we now have none. We have a purpose built facility right now and yet we have done very little to encourage people to use it. We have apps to direct people to car parks in the city centre, yet most references to Park and Ride on social media talk about why people can't use it because it's closed. Cllr, rather than waiting years for potential Park and Ride at Cardiff Parkway, why not make this more appealing now, and cut congestion in our gridlocked city right now?

Reply - Cllr De'Ath

I think to be honest the issue is that the Cardiff East Park and Ride is in the wrong place. The figures speak for themselves. There were more than 200 car journeys per day to and from the University Hospital Wales, but less than 50 from Cardiff East into the city centre. I know this is an issue you're very concerned about, and officers met with some of the local councillors a few weeks ago; I'm not sure if you were there. If you would like to meet with me to go over your concerns we can do that. I think the evidence really speaks for itself unfortunately.

Cllr Livesy to Cllr De'Ath

Sections of cycling lanes along Llantrisant Road are currently intermittent and disconnected. A key section is south of the Plasdŵr development below the Radyr/Plasdŵr junction down to Danescourt station and Llandaff through a narrow road with a bad pavement on one side. When will this be addressed, connecting commuting cyclists safely with the rest of the cycling or train network?

Reply - Cllr De'Ath

I have an incredibly wordy answer to your question so I can only apologise for it in advance. The Section 106 agreement for the outline planning permission for the Plasdŵr development ensures funding for extending provision for cyclists and pedestrians along the Llantrisant Road corridor, beyond the point where the existing shared use path diverts away from Llantrisant Road along Heol Aradur. The Section 106 agreement secures funding to establish a shared cycle/pedestrian route between

Heol Aradur and the eastern junction of Danescourt Way and Llantrisant Road. The connection would need to be integrated with the planned junction signalisation schemes at the two Danescourt Way junctions with Llantrisant Road, which will also be funded by way of a Section 106 agreement. From the eastern junction of Danescourt Way, the shared pedestrian/cycle route will connect to a planned segregated cycling facility along the section of Llantrisant Road between Danescourt Way and the junction of Llantrisant Road and Bridge Street, which will also be funded through the Section 106 agreement. Plans for the connecting section of cycleway through the Llandaff area are being progressed by the Council's transport team as part of the cycleways programme. So, in essence, it will be connected; a lot of it will be dependent on when some of those Section 106 release points are triggered. I hope that makes sense

Supplementary question – Cllr Livesy

So I guess by release point you mean number of houses built?

Reply – Cllr De'Ath

There will be various points in the unfolding plan process where that money is released. I will ask officers to give you a briefing in terms of dates on when that will happen, so that will hopefully make the whole thing a bit clearer to everyone.

Cllr Moultrie to Cllr Merry

Edible playgrounds are being rolled out throughout schools in Cardiff. Could the Cabinet Member confirm the schools doing this in Pentwyn and Llanedeyrn?

Reply – Cllr Merry

Four school in the Pentwyn ward have either had or are having edible playgrounds installed as part of our programme and partnership with Trees for Cities. These are The Hollies School, which was completed in September 2021; and Llanedeyrn Primary School, which was completed last month. Edible and healthy playgrounds are also being installed at Bryn Celyn Primary School and Pen y Groes Primary School, and they will be installed in March of this year.

Supplementary question – Cllr Moultrie

With these schools taking edible playgrounds on, what benefits do they bring to the children using them?

Reply – Cllr Merry

I think the importance of growing space within, certainly our inner city schools, to pupils is probably one of the more well-documented pieces of research that's been done. The particular benefits that this scheme brings, is because of the partnership work with Trees for Cities, and also Grow Cardiff. The teaching staff will get the ongoing support at first to get the gardens actually established. Less well-documented, but I'd have thought for most of us intuitive, is the extra benefit that will bring to pupils' wellbeing, considering the difficulties that many pupils have found adjusting to school post-Covid. The charity's also developing teaching materials that dovetail with the new Welsh curriculum, and examples from other schools have involved intergenerational work, or with families coming in and it leading on to conversations about cooking and healthy diet; and it's interesting, in two of our

primary schools recently that have had the edible playgrounds installed, Estyn highlighted them in their report when they came in as an example of good practice.

Cllr Robson on behalf of Cllr Cowan to Cllr Wild

How much has the new waste collection trial cost the taxpayer to date and what has been the total overtime cost (please provide the overtime rates per hour)?

Reply - Cllr Wild

Obviously the Council has a statutory duty to collect people's waste from their properties, and we also now have a statutory duty around meeting very ambitious recycling rates. The new trial has been planned to sit within the budget envelope of £12.8 million that we put forward every year, and we don't expect it to affect overtime costs in any particular way. But you are right to indicate that there are some additional costs associated with the trial; there's been a lot of set up and new equipment to buy, and there are obviously complexities to work out exactly the additional cost to what it would have cost otherwise. But the estimate I've been given is that around £400,000 in this year's finances, and again I would stress that this is within our budget envelope. However, we would also expect some savings; the green bags that we're cutting down, as we've said before, cost the Council nearly £1 million a year. The wider thought around this is around the circular economy and the example I give is glass. At the moment the glass is smashed, it's commingled; it costs us £35 a tonne to get removed. If we can get that glass clear and separated, we'll get £35 a tonne into our investment. So when all that stuff comes through, which is the plan, it should actually help with our budgets, and making it a more circular economy at the same time.

Supplementary question - Cllr Robson

One thing about the trial is that there has been a lot of change and a lot of disruption to those people who are in trial areas, and there have been cases where vehicles have gone back, even if it is within the affordability envelope. So to ensure we don't have more disruption and confusion, will you therefore commit to ensuring that black waste collections remain fortnightly and are not increased to every 3 weeks?

Reply - Cllr Wild

I'd like to thank you and your ward colleagues. I know you 've been heavily involved in the trial and passing on information, which it's really important all councillors do that: serving their constituents; trying to get recycling rates up, which I have to say at the moment look really promising this guarter. So we're hopeful, with this new strategy, it's really going to jump us up, possibly into the highest performing core city in the UK; which is where we'd all really, really like to be. But in terms of the 3-weekly collection, we've got to give our officers the opportunity, if we need to do it. We may have to meet statutory targets; huge fines if we don't do it, and we want them to have all the tools and all the skills for us to be the absolute best we can be, and that's what we owe the people of this city. And if that means they need to tinker with some of the other things including changing the amount we collect, we should give them the tools to bring that forward as an option. At the moment we're still working on those 2weekly ones; we're working on the other changes around the city; or the new recycling hubs that we're setting up; the other parts of the new strategy that are working well; let's get those in. But at the moment it's looking very good in terms of our figures.

Cllr Molik to Cllr Mackie

When will Welsh Labour recognise and state that Brexit and the loss of freedom of movement has led to a dire situation and heightened the health and social care workforce crisis in Cardiff and across Wales?

Reply – Cllr Mackie

Whilst I'm pleased to say that the supply of care within Cardiff is good at present, concerns still remain about the ability of providers to recruit and retain staff. It's generally thought that the care sector in Cardiff was not as reliant on the EU workforce as some other parts of the country. However, it's possible that there's been an indirect impact on of Brexit arising from the large number of vacancies in retail and hospitality, and some care workers have chosen alternative employment in these sectors. As Members are aware, registered care workers are now paid the Real Living Wage following additional funding from the Welsh Government. In addition, our Cardiff Cares Academy has helped 122 people now to get a job in the care sector. Some UK care providers have also employed non-UK care workers from overseas through the visa sponsorship scheme. We'll continue to work with the care providers to understand and where we can address the issue of recruitment and retention in our sector.

Supplementary question – Cllr Molik

It's interesting that every time you talk about the workforce challenges and the reasons perhaps underlying underneath that, we quite often get an answer that actually it's working quite well in Cardiff. And then you see what we saw with the staff member I mentioned earlier. It's not working; you know, in every single report that's presented regarding social care, the workforce challenge still remains quite strongly and firmly as a reason why our social care isn't working. It is important that we admit this. So my question was: we've seen various workforces go on strike, regarding pay, regarding the circumstances and the working environment that they're dealing with. Our care workers are probably the ones that are facing really low pay...

CIIr Molik

Sustainability of this workforce has been an ongoing issue, you've said that in your response too. So it is important that we recognise that this workforce is better paid, better working environment, and the reasons behind why we are losing the workforce. The sustainability isn't going to happen unless you admit to that...

Cllr Molik

It's about recognising the problem, that was my initial question. Despite the response being actually there isn't a problem, you still go on to say actually we've lost workforce; we can't sustain the workforce; the work environment remains; the pay grade needs a review...

Cllr Molik

When will the care providers in the city be recognised for their work and given what they deserve in terms of their work environment and their pay?

Reply – Cllr Mackie

I think we do recognise the work that our care providers give, and we're doing what we can to enhance their work and to help them as much as we can. As I said, at the moment we have not got a shortage in Cardiff, because we are addressing it. We are looking at different ways of working, as you know, and looking at different ways we're providing care, as we've said before, with direct payments for people to get care in different ways that suit them better, as we've said before. We're looking at it all the time. We're not sitting back on our laurels because we haven't got a problem at the moment; we're continuing to address it in the ways I've described previously, and we'll continue to do that. As far as the pay goes, they were paid through Welsh Government the Living Wage; we would like them to get more, of course we would, and we'll keep challenging it. But at the minute, that's where we are.

Cllr Livesy to Cllr De'Ath

When can we expect the statement outlining consultation timescales for the Replacement Local Development Plan?

Reply - Cllr De'Ath

I'm just finalising this with officials and colleagues, I'll be issuing a formal statement very shortly. I would imagine it would be early February.

Cllr Thomson to Cllr Lister

Can the Cabinet Member update Council on the work being done to improve outcomes for children, young people and families in the care of Cardiff?

Reply – Cllr Lister

Earlier this month Cabinet approved our revised Children's Services Strategy over the next three years, looking to shift the balance of care and improve outcomes for children and young people. We've got a focus on three different areas. Place, to ensure that children and young people are in the right place; whether that is with their birth family, with adoptive families, with foster families or I residential care. It's making sure the options are there and they are always safe; I think that has to be one of our key priorities. Through that we're going to implement the right place model, which means they're in the right place at the right time, and receive the right level of intervention. We're continuing to work on the Family Drug and Alcohol Court project, which has seen some good results already. It's important to note, there's been a 115% increase in referrals to Children's Services, but less than 10% of those have gone on to become Children Looked After, so I think that's credit to the preventative work that we are doing. We're going to focus on people, and pay tribute as Cllr Molik said, to the care sector, because they do fantastic work; but then our social workers, our domiciliary care workers, they're doing fantastic work. We're looking to implement a trusted adult model to make sure we're running out prudent social work across the city, so only social workers are doing what social workers should do and families have consistency in the support they're offered. Finally, to ensure we retain that workforce, we're looking at developing practice: so we've got practice leads in place, to support newly qualified staff and more experienced staff to continue developing; and we're looking at motivational interviewing. And core to everything we're doing. and it's part of the Children's Services revised strategy, is ensuring the voice of the child is at the heart of everything we do.

Supplementary question – Cllr Thomson

There's a lot of focus quite rightly given to improving life chances of children and young people who are in our care, something which every single one of us has responsibility towards as corporate parent. It's also really important to make sure we don't put young people into care who shouldn't be in care. And you've mentioned prevention briefly; I'm just wondering if you could talk a little bit more about how well we are preventing young people coming into care?

Reply - Cllr Lister

Yes that is really important work; because when a child does become looked after, it has to be a decision that is right for the child and the family, in order to keep them safe and give them the best opportunities. So that has to be the last resort. The majority of our focus has to be on that preventative work: looking at our early help services when children are very young; whether that's the Flying Start provision, help with parenting courses that we offer, or when things become slightly more serious it becomes statutory intervention. Just working on the cusp of that: care and support plans; getting in with interventions from the Interventions Hub; support for families; there's lots of work going on. I was with Children's' Services staff for half a day on Tuesday, looking at how we develop the workforce and how we can support them in all the fantastic work they do; and it was lovely to see around the room 135 compliments that have been received this year on the work they've done with families, and I'd just like to put on record my thanks to those staff.

Cllr Davies to Cllr Wild

How will the Council act to clean up areas affected by recent flooding?

Reply - Cllr Wild

As you can appreciate, it puts Council staff under considerable pressure when there are flooding incidents; during it but also after the event. We envisage that the clean-up operation will continue through until mid-February for the Cardiff Bay area, our parks, and the river corridors. And of course, that's because they're doing a lot of additional clear-up work on top of their day-to-day duties of keeping the city clean. I'm sure the councillor and others will join me in thanking the Council staff that worked during those floods, through the nights, many of whom worked two or three nights in a row; really doing their best to keep on top of things, which in the main they did really well. And we're also really grateful to the growing network of volunteers and groups who work hard clearing up; I know Cardiff Rivers were very busy every weekend, helping out especially around the rivers.

Supplementary question – Cllr Davies

You'll find no gripe from me about Council staff, I think they've done an excellent job. I just wanted to get some confirmation as it were on whose responsibility it is exactly when it comes to the Taff, and clearing that up: because as we heard in the public questions earlier, when it comes to all the debris that's come up from the Taff and has been hanging on trees is very unsightly. We want to re-beautify our city, because it's very visible from the Taff Trail. So essentially some confirmation of responsibility, and how the Council is working with that; but also what about the timelines when it comes to sorting out that specific project. I'd really appreciate something so we can restore the view from the Taff Trail to its natural beauty.

Reply - Cllr Wild

In terms of responsibility for the Taff: in terms of flood defences that's NRW for our main river courses, our main streams; in terms of clear up that's us doing that work; and as I outlined earlier in my responses I would expect that to be finished mid-February.

Cllr Taylor to Cllr De'Ath

What steps is the Council taking to tackle congestion on the city's road network?

Reply – Cllr De'Ath

The Council manages congestion every day through the UTC control room, more broadly through a series of measures, most of which you're familiar with: bike lanes, bus gates, cycle hire schemes, etc. In the longer term we'll explore measures like the Metro and of course the new Cardiff Crossrail.

Supplementary question – Cllr Taylor

I'm particularly interested in what's being done to tackle congestion to give priority to buses. A number of residents have written over the months with concerns about the number 35, 8 and 9 route which runs through Gabalfa. We're expecting changes to most or all of those routes. We know that congestion is also having a huge detrimental impact on the city's bus network, and the franchising element that you mentioned earlier in response to the public question. It's going to take years to implement and the bus network is facing difficulties now. My question is: when will we see a comprehensive capital investment programme brought forwards to give buses priorities on our road network?

Reply - Cllr De'Ath

I meet regularly with the senior staff at Cardiff Bus; we've worked through a number of quick wins and measures we can bring in to make life easier for buses in the city, and over the course of the administration we'll also be making announcements in a more comprehensive way on how we can easily ease the route of buses through Cardiff.

Cllr Gibson to Cllr Wild

So called disposable vapes are growing in popularity. It's common to see them laying in the street when they have expired. Does Cardiff Council have a suitable way of disposing of or recycling these vapes?

Reply - Cllr Wild

Despite being called disposable vapes, they should still be recycled after use. The vapes can be recycled alongside small electrical items at our recycling centres and also dropped off at our 8 community recycling zones across the city. And Councillor Gibson, just to give you some credit and show you that when you come to Council you have a chance to influence things, that wasn't on our A to Z of things that you can recycle; it's going to be added on now you brought it to our attention, so thank you for bringing the question to me.

Supplementary question – Cllr Gibson

I think that's my supplementary been answered by that; because what I wanted to know is, would Cardiff Council advertise to people, let people know, that these vapes

can be recycled and how are they going to be recycled? Are they going to be part of the circular economy, do you know what way this is going to happen?

Reply – Cllr Wild

I think we will do that promotion, like I say; we'll go and start spreading the word as we are doing. In terms of how they are recycled, I don't know the precise details, it's part of small electrical component recycling, which we want to get people to collect together. We're trying actually to get all those small electricals as part of our new recycling strategy. People can actually start putting it out; we're hoping to get there at some stage, we're not quite there yet. But it will all go in; it is part of the circular economy, if we can collect it all in the right way.

Cllr Chowdhury to Cllr Merry

Will the Cabinet Member for Education join me in congratulating Canton's Fitzalan High on their recent outstanding results once again?

Reply – Cllr Merry

Yes absolutely, I would be delighted to congratulate pupils and staff at Fitzalan for their outstanding results. I hope the Member won't take it amiss if I can add in congratulations to all our schools, on the back of that, in Cardiff for their work during the pandemic and the recovery phase, which has allowed pupils' at key stages 4 and 5 to achieve such excellent results. The summer 2022 exam series was the first set exam period since 2019 and Cardiff results were higher in most areas compared to the previous years, and were above Welsh averages.

Supplementary question – Cllr Chowdhury

Would Councillor Merry agree with me in acknowledging that, taking into consideration the devastating impact on young people, throughout the pandemic years and the subsequent consequences, these excellent results are a testament of the remarkable dedication, the hard work of the staff, the pupils, their supporting families and the wider community.

Reply – Cllr Merry

I think we are conscious the last few years have not been an easy few years for many teaching staff and pupils and families, and I agree that it's down to their efforts to put pupils first, and their wellbeing as well.

Cllr Williams to Cllr Thorne

Well-placed sources in Cardiff Council tell me the Council is presently exploring locations in the east and west of the city as candidate sites for gypsy and traveller pitches. Can the Cabinet Member confirm and list which candidate sites are being assessed for locations for gypsy and traveller pitches in Cardiff, and can the answer also list any sites recently assessed and confirm whether they have been deemed suitable for gypsy and traveller pitches?

Reply - Cllr Thorne

The Council will be consulting on candidate sites submitted by landowners and developers for possible inclusion in the replacement Local Development Plan, in parallel with the preferred strategy later this year. The findings of this consultation will feed into the assessment of the candidate sites which is planned to commence This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg

following the completion of the consultation process. And I suggest you should get yourself some new sources because I can confirm that no candidate sites have been submitted at this stage, proposing new gypsy traveller sites in Cardiff. Work is, however, progressing to identify sites to meet the evidence needed for permanent and transit, gypsy and travellers' sites. This has included discussions with Welsh Government, and work continues to secure appropriate outcomes, and I will update members on the outcome of these discussions once concluded.

Supplementary question - Cllr Williams

Crucially, my question Councillor Thorne was exploring; now my sources in Cardiff Council tell me that sites have been explored in Ely, Whitchurch and Tongwynlais, and indeed in Councillor Bradbury's ward, so can you assure me that elected members will be briefed on proposed candidate sites, and can you provide this Chamber with assurances that those wards affected have already had Member briefings?

Reply - Cllr Thorne

Members haven't had briefings because those sites have never been brought forward for discussion, or for consultation; so I think you just need, I've said to you, you need to speak to your sources again and perhaps you need to get some new ones, because clearly they're giving you incorrect information.

Cllr Robert Hopkins to Cllr Thomas

Given the requirement for voter ID at future general elections, what is the Council doing to prevent this having a negative impact on voter turnout within Cardiff? In light of the types of identification that are allowed, how can the Council avoid a situation where these requirements discourage participation by Cardiff's younger voters and voters in more disadvantaged groups in particular?

Reply - Cllr Thomas

To answer the question Councillor Hopkins, I'm sure, like me, you feel that this is a sledgehammer to crack a nut. When Ministers are interrogated on the number of voter fraud incidents in the last general election, the figure in a population of 60plus million was just six; so this has all the hallmarks, to my mind, of voter suppression by a desperate Tory government that is going to lose the next election. I am seriously concerned about the impact this will have on turnout: and particularly because, as you identify in your question, it is younger voters and indeed disadvantaged groups who are more likely to be affected, for example not owning driver's licenses or passports; or indeed, as I understand it, a bizarre situation that an older person's railcard qualifies as ID, but a younger person's railcard does not qualify as ID. I wonder whether some people on the benches opposite could explain to us how that stacks up? The Council will do everything we can to mitigate those impacts. The Council's electoral services team have commenced a long-term engagement campaign to raise awareness of the new requirements for registered electors to take ID, as you say, noting that this is only for UK Parliamentary elections and Police and Crime Commissioner elections in Wales. Local elections and election to the Senedd mercifully are under the remit of the Labour-led Welsh Government. In addition to what the Council is doing, the campaign that we're running promotes the free voter authority certificate application service for those who do not have a suitable form of photo ID, and these certificates can be

applied for online, by post or in person at the electoral services office in County Hall. This service will help to ensure that all electors can access a form of photo ID for voting in the reserved polls.

Supplementary question – Cllr Hopkins

I was going to ask the Leader actually whether he agreed with me that this requirement for voter ID is a response to an imagined problem, voter fraud, for which there is little or no evidence, and I can see that he does. But notwithstanding the free voter identification certificate will be available, this will have to be on request, and outside the passport or driving licence, the list of allowable other documentation, as the leader has intimated, is largely targeted at the over-60s. These factors are highly likely to put an obstacle in the way of those groups already less likely to vote, and if this happens it would certainly not serve democracy. Moreover, does it not make a nonsense of Councillor Robson's statement during the debate on proportional representation last July that we should not be focusing on implementing a fair voting system, but instead we should be focusing on increasing voter turnout?

Reply - Cllr Thomas

I think Councillor Robson may be being hung by his own petard with his words on that issue. I've made my feelings known, I agree with you. Rest assured, again mitigating what I think will be a significant impact, the Council, the campaign we're running will try to particularly target the so-called hard to reach groups, and using partnership work, try and reach across internal and external stakeholders to raise awareness of these new requirements, and there are national campaigns to ensure a clear and consistent message. Let's just hope it's slightly clearer than some of the dual messages we had during the Covid pandemic from figures in number 10. I want to draw Members' attention also to the written briefing I supplied to members on the 12th of January, and that's going to be followed up on the 21st of February by a briefing to all Members by the Electoral Services team.

Cllr Boes to Cllr Mackie

Given the current difficulties in recruiting qualified occupational therapists and social workers, can the Cabinet Member give an update on the progress being made?

Reply - Cllr Mackie

As Members are aware, there's a national shortage of qualified social workers and occupational therapists, and this, combined with increasing demand, is putting considerable pressure on social services throughout Wales. In Cardiff, we've taken a number of actions to address this, including monitoring vacancies and ensuring that they are advertised as soon as possible. Officers are attending university open days and job fairs to encourage recruitment. We're supporting our social workers by streamlining processes and reducing paperwork; and we're also developing a trusted assessor approach, which allows experienced officers to carry out a wider range of work with the appropriate oversight. This will ensure our qualified staff have time to focus on cases that require their expertise. In the meantime, our managed agency service is undertaking social work assessments on our behalf. Longer-term plans are being developed to grow our own workforce, and a range of initiatives are being considered, such as sponsored college placements, internal secondments and increasing the number of hosted students' placements that lead to job offers when qualified.

Supplementary question – Cllr Boes

What's the level of agency social workers and OT's we're using at the moment?

Reply - Cllr Mackie

I have got the number of vacancies we've got at the minute; we've got 20 social worker vacancies, which is about 15% of the qualified workforce, and in older person's services that's higher at 20%. I can find out for you the answers that you've asked for and get them to you.

Cllr Littlechild to Cllr Wild

Could the Cabinet Member give us an update on the installation of 24 new electric vehicle charging points that were promised at his press release in October?

Reply - Cllr Wild

Twenty of the new charging points have now been installed and are operational. There's another four that are in the final stages of implementation, following a requirement for some on-site design amendments.

Supplementary question – Cllr Littlechild

Being a new electric vehicle owner myself, I was delighted to see the press release and started reading the social media posts. Every single one of them asked for the vital information which every electric car owner needs, what kilowatt hour these will be or whether they are tethered or non-tethered charging points. I turned up to the Splott Hub to find out that they're not non-tethered charging points and they are seven kilowatt chargers, so the top-up chargers that were promised actually would take eight hours to charge a car. When will the Cabinet Member promise that we could have a reliable 50-kilowatt tethered charger, so we can fast charge our cars through the city?

Reply - Cllr Wild

I hope you didn't get stuck in Splott overnight, although I'm sure you'd have been given a warm welcome, coming down to that part of the city. It's very complex putting in electric chargers. We don't build gas stations for petrol cars, so actually if everyone's going to move to electric cars it's interesting, whether you think the state should supply all that electricity - which would be very different, that would almost be a nationalisation of the energy system, which I'm all for; or whether it's for the private sector to actually speed up on some of this. We're trying a number of different routes. If every single car in the city moves over, it's going to need to change massively. We're taking some of our responsibility, but also pavement space is at a premium: a lot of people don't want more things on the pavements; we want to have wider pavements and other things; in some cases they're a bit of a hazard; so lots of complexities. We're moving forward with a number of schemes, putting more on public land; but we also need the private sector to work a lot of these things out as well. And I would imagine the car industry is probably going to change in different ways as well, as well as obviously people who buy them working out how they can charge them at their own homes.

Cllr Berman to Cllr Weaver

When a resident is advised by Cardiff Council's C2C service to contact their Councillor to get something sorted; and when they then do, and the Councillor obtains a reply back for them from the relevant service area containing advice that in future they should raise such queries via C2C; would you agree that there appears to be something wrong with the Council's customer service provision?

Reply – Cllr Weaver

It's not C2C policy to refer residents to contact their Councillor unless the resident advises they've already been in direct contact with them and are seeking a specific update. If they are looking to make a complaint about a policy they'd be advised to contact the relevant Cabinet Member or director regarding that policy. Overwhelmingly, overall, I think our staff provide fantastic service to the residents of Cardiff, but it's always very important to hear about where people think we can do better; and if you would be happy to contact me with some details I would be very pleased to get officers to investigate this situation.

Supplementary question – Cllr Berman

I think in this particular case the resident was perhaps a little bit more bemused by the reply then actually making a serious complaint here; but what seems to be at the heart of this is that we still seem to have a problem with the customer service ethos in this Council, and all too often as Councillors we find that we are only able to pass on replies saying something can't be done, to a member of staff. What more could we do to try to get a more can-do attitude to try to solve residents' problems?

Reply – Cllr Weaver

As I said, I think overwhelmingly our staff do have a can-do attitude and provide a fantastic service and customer service to the citizens of this city. There are thousands and thousands of interactions between our residents and the Council every day, and overwhelmingly, I think, our staff do a fantastic job. As I said, it's really important to hear about where people think we can improve so that we can learn and try and make any changes that we may need to. But I do actually stand by what our staff are doing. We, a few years ago, refreshed our customer service approach following a report from a cross-party scrutiny committee; a really fantastic report, very much chimed with the objectives of the administration. Obviously, it's been a few years since we launched that; we've had Covid in between; it's very important to relaunch or refresh that. But I will reiterate the thanks I give to our staff who have, over many years that I've been a Councillor, provided superb support to citizens. But please do send the details because we would just like to check if there's anything we can improve.

Cllr Lay to Cllr Thomas

Given our successful bid for Levelling Up funding announced last week for the first element of the Cardiff Crossrail, does the Leader agree with me that the announcement makes the delivery of Cardiff Parkway, in my ward of Trowbridge and St Mellons, even more important as the eventual end point for the Crossrail? Can you update us on any progress made to secure the consent for this scheme?

Reply - Cllr Thomas

I will agree wholeheartedly that the delivery of Cardiff Parkway is critical for economic development and prosperity, both of your ward and much of east Cardiff. And I want This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg

to state categorically that it's not just the train station component but also the business park component as well. It's striking, isn't it, that actually Cardiff Bay train station in the south of the city is actually the most easterly train station in the city; so there remains a significant void in terms of access to public transport by rail from much of the east of the city. You will be aware, of course, that having passed the application through our Planning Committee, the matter has been called in and is now with Welsh Government to consider. But rest assured that we are making very clear the views of this Council, this administration, the wider City region and indeed people like the Burns delivery commission, that it is fundamentally important that this station is progressed; noting of course that Welsh Government is an equity partner in the very same venture.

Supplementary question – Cllr Lay

It's really great to hear that. My residents of Trowbridge and St Mellons have been waiting a very long time for this Parkway to actually come to fruition; and they are very excited, not only about the Parkway, but also bus rapid transport links, which would also go round the east of Cardiff as well. But the adjoining business park, as you quite rightly mentioned, is very much needed to attract high quality, thousands of jobs to the area. What work is being done to attract businesses to the site?

Reply - Cllr Thomas

You mentioned bus rapid transit, and I think there is a significant opportunity to integrate the train station with that mode of transport as well. Cllr De'Ath was touching earlier on the current location difficulties with the Park and Ride at Pentwyn; but actually once the new station is in place, a bus connection eastwards to connect it to the railway there would be transformative, accessed of course by Llanrumney residents across the new bridge this administration is building there. Likewise there are plans for a bus link connection eastwards from St Mellons towards Newport as well, which is another dimension to integrating that destination into the public transport network. And there are all sorts of conversations going on, I know, being led by the developer, as to the type of inward investments that could be secured, particularly in industries like life sciences, like compound semiconductors, where Cardiff and the City region have a strong comparative advantage. And there are great examples you know - look at Edinburgh, Green Park on the outskirts of London - where this type of campus-style business park, which doesn't exist in South Wales really at the scale that we're talking here, could deliver significant high-paying jobs within walking distance of your ward and within seven minutes travel of the city centre of Cardiff as well.

Cllr Michael to Cllr Thomas

Does the Leader agree with me that the announcement of Levelling Up Fund funding, match funded by Welsh Government, is great news for Cardiff, unlocking plans 20 years in the making, for the Crossrail scheme from the north-west of Cardiff to St Mellons in the east?

Reply – Cllr Thomas

Cllr Michael, as a councillor of long standing, I'm sure you will recognise the parallels between the Crossrail scheme and other components of the transport strategy with the Cardiff Transport Partnership that was in place pre-2004, but was of course not taken forward by the successor administration after that This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg

election. I think that the success now allows us to make good on an ambition 20 years in the making, to create a viable metro system for all of Cardiff. But particularly, as I was saying earlier to Councillor Lay, serving those communities in wards like myself, Splott, Tremorfa, Rumney, and Llanrumney and St Mellons, that are very poorly served by the rail infrastructure currently; even though we have, of course, the Great Western main line cutting through our communities. So a great opportunity, a fantastic coup for Cardiff I would argue, and very excited to be getting on with the delivery of the first phase now.

Supplementary – Cllr Michael

Imagine, if the original scheme was actually put together and delivered 20 years ago, imagine the changes this City would have seen. That was killed off because the Leader at the time had a complete lack of vision. The Leader at the time was Rodney Berman, who scrapped the scheme, supported by the Tories. I notice a subtle change in what they said, they now say they support Crossrail; and I welcome that conversion. So would the Leader agree that their newfound enthusiasm is to be welcomed? Would you agree with me that the newfound enthusiasm by the Lib Dems for recycling is to be welcomed since they just recycled a tired old leader?

Reply – Cllr Thomas

I see some of the jokes are being recycled as well, Cllr Michael, and that's very good to see. We've had plenty of questions in this Chamber today and on multiple occasions about public transport in the city and issues of congestion. I think we all want to see that improvement, and I think you know, we are paying the penalties of a failure to invest, in a failure of vision. Back at the stage when the Transport Partnership was shelved in 2004, I think when we look back at that period in the city's development, I think we will see it in the years to come, as a period where momentum, that had been built up in the city's regeneration by successive Labour administrations, stalled. From the Transport Plan being shelved; declining standards in our schools; we know about the thousands of children let down, who left our schools as NEETs. And we know, in a time of plenty, how money was wasted on pet projects: £100,000 a year on the Dr Who exhibition; £1 million subsidy per year on the swimming pool; failing to fix the roof while the sun was shining; and the £1 million loan to Glamorgan cricket club that that had to be written off by the successive Labour administration. So not a great time for our city. Thank goodness we are now into a third historic term of a Labour administration that's got the determination to take bold decisions that's needed on transport and indeed every other aspect of city life for the benefits of our residents.

Cllr Wong to Cllr Merry

It is expected that the proposed Velodrome as part of the International Sports Village, will be partly funded from Cardiff Council's education budget. Can the Cabinet Member for Education explain why the education budget is being used to contribute to the proposed velodrome?

Reply – Cllr Merry

The financial contribution to the relocation of the cycle track forms part of the overall cost of the school budget programme. The revenue budget for education in schools is a separate funding stream which is reviewed on an annual basis as part of the Council's overall budget. No alternative sites are available, but if the Council had *This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg*

identified an alternative site that was of sufficient size, available and could facilitate the expansion at the school, then this would have been a cost to the Council to be met by the school budget programme, as has been the case with other projects. The proposed replacement of Cathays High School relies on the relocation of the cycle track to comply with the area requirements set out in the budget building bulletin guidelines for new secondary schools. The contribution towards relocation of the cycle track therefore represents a prudent use of the financial resources in the school budget programme: to provide 21st century learning facilities for learners at Cathays High School; to provide much-needed school places; ALN places; to replace a C-Condition school building; and actually to provide the school with playing fields like every other secondary school in this city has.

Supplementary question – Cllr Wong

Does the Cabinet Member regard that financial contribution, which will help deliver a new state of the art school and a new state-of-the-art Velodrome, as a good outcome for young people across the city?

Reply - Cllr Merry

Obviously, Cabinet continues to listen very carefully to any expressions of concern, but I would need to underline the fact that if alternative sites had been available, that would undoubtedly have cost additional money compared to moving the cycle track. I think that every Member in this Council Chamber should actually consider carefully whether they think it's appropriate that if a new school requires a site that is being used for another alternative community use, that the Education Department should consider how they can move that facility. If they're suggesting that education should be allowed to commandeer sites, at no cost, across the city, then I think that is something they may regret. But it will bring benefits to children across the city in terms of providing additional school places which are much needed at a time when our secondary schools are under pressure. We all know the concerns that we actually have around our ALN provision, and I actually think it's very regrettable that opposition members seem to consider the provision of a high school with playing fields is of so little importance.

Cllr Wong to Cllr Merry

Can the Cabinet Member for Education comment on the examples of educational best practice from Cardiff schools highlighted in the recent Estyn annual report?

Reply – Cllr Merry

I was really pleased to see examples of best practice from Cardiff schools included in Estyn's annual report. Cathays High School was highlighted twice, once under a section about school leaders showing a wholehearted commitment to inclusion and high standards. To quote: "The work of the school is underpinned by the school's mission of opportunities for all, and the Head teacher has a clear vision for raising aspiration, broadening horizons and maximising the achievement and well-being of all pupils." Cathays was also included as a case study on developing the professional learning provision within the school. The pupil referral unit at Bryn y Deryn was also mentioned in terms of its notable culture and ethos of supporting wellbeing across the city. Furthermore, the council was acknowledged for its support of refugees and asylum seekers. The inspectors found that the council provides a high level of support for asylum seekers and refugees who arrive in the area. Outside of

this report, it is also worth noting that almost half of all Cardiff schools inspected since the reintroduction of inspections following the pandemic, had been asked to write good practice case studies by Estyn.

Supplementary question - Cllr Wong

As the Chair of Governors at Cathays High School I am proud, proud, of Estyn's recognition of the school's fantastic work in tackling the impact of poverty and disadvantage. Cathays High School is a highly successful multicultural, multilingual, and multifaith school. Does the Cabinet Member agree that a new school build for Cathays High School is critical in continuing to help our diverse communities across the city to succeed educationally?

Reply - Cllr Merry

I think the Council was very clear in the rationale that it actually put forward for the reasons for a new school for Cathays. It was in a central location at a time when we have pressure on secondary school places, which enables additional provision to be provided at the most convenient location for pupils across the city. We are very clear about the desperate need of ALN places in the city, and that's been substantiated in a number of education reports; and there is nothing to date that I have seen that has undermined for me the reasons why we put that proposal forward in the first place, even as we continue to listen to any feedback we have.

Cllr Lewis to Cllr Goodway

The arena development in Butetown offers the opportunity for local jobs for local people, in both the construction phase and operation of the centre. Can the Cabinet Member advise which actions will be taken to ensure that local residents, especially those from underrepresented groups, are aware of job vacancies and feel confident and ready to apply for these roles?

Reply – Cllr Goodway

The Councillor is entirely correct in her assessment that the Arena development will create significant job opportunities for local people. However, I'm conscious that local people have heard that all too often over the past 30 years plus, but didn't see their ambitions materialise. So I want to ensure that the Council, the developer, the construction companies, the arena operator and the community, work together to make sure we put in place arrangements that will deliver the outcomes we want to see. To give the Councillor confidence of that commitment, I can confirm that the Council's Into Work team has already committed to work with the developers and the operators to ensure that job vacancies are promoted locally, and to provide support to local people to apply for jobs. The Into Work team will effectively operate as an employment agency for the Arena development, with a remit to ensuring that its economic benefits are felt locally. This will include activity such as local jobs fairs within the ward, and dedicated training programmes, alongside targeted community engagement activity within Butetown as well as neighbouring wards. The Into Work team has already established community engagement officers who will develop these links, and the Cardiff Commitment team will promote opportunities in local schools. This work will also specifically target under-represented groups

Supplementary question – Cllr Lewis

Thank you Cllr Goodway, for your comprehensive response recognising the need to ensure that local people be given the opportunity for direct job opportunities in the arena. What I'd like to ask further is, will they ensure that not just the normal training opportunities for the construction jobs are there; but just for more unique roles rather like sound technicians and stage management, that can ensure that there's permanent professional jobs, upskilling people in the area?

Reply – Cllr Goodway

Yes, Lord Mayor, I can confirm that. In conversations that have already taken place involving the Leader of the Council with Live Nation, I have heard that commitment being given by the company that they want to ensure that local people can not only train to work in this particular venue; but because of the international reach of Live Nation, they believe that we could get to a point where people that grew up in Cardiff could be working in Los Angeles and other places at the highest level of their licence. I want to say that this is a real opportunity to deliver for the people of Butetown and the neighbouring wards. Because I am conscious, having been here, some people would say too long, but having been here so long, that those people have been let down; first by the Cardiff Bay Development Corporation and then by successive authorities in the city. The low point came when the Welsh Labour Government made an offer to the Lib Dem administration in this Council to accept £17 million to avoid the need to deal with that wall that goes down Bute Street. That was unforgivable. The only thing I can say I'm proud of, the Welsh Government would never have made that offer to me.

10 : URGENT BUSINESS

There was no urgent business

11 : COMMITTEE MEMBERSHIP

To receive nominations and make appointments to current committee vacancies as set out in the report and in accordance with the approved allocation of seats and political group wishes.

RESOLVED: The Council AGREED to receive a nomination and appoint to the vacancy on the Committee, in accordance with the Party Group wishes, as set out in Table A and on the Amendment Sheet.

12 : MEMBERS SCHEDULE OF REMUNERATION

Approval is sought for an amendment to the approved duties contained within Cardiff Council's Members' Schedule of Remuneration as recommended by the Democratic Services Committee.

RESOLVED: The Council AGREED to:

- a) approve the amended list of "Approved Duties" within Schedule 2 of the Members' Schedule of Remuneration 2022/23, as described in **Appendix A**; and
- adopt the revised Members' Schedule of Remuneration 2022-23 as attached at Appendix B with immediate effect, and ask the Head of Democratic Services to provide the requisite notification to the IRPW; and
- c) authorise the Monitoring Officer to update the Members' Schedule of Remuneration within Part 6 of the Constitution accordingly.
- 13 : APPOINTMENT OF LOCAL AUTHORITY GOVERNORS TO SCHOOL GOVERNING BODIES

To appoint Local Authority School Governors to fill vacancies

RESOLVED: The Council AGREED to, in accordance with the recommendations of the Local Authority Governor Panel, approve the new appointments of Local Authority governors to the school governing bodies as set out in Appendix 1 and Appendix 2, each for a term of 4 years from the date of the appointment.

14 : OFFICER DECISION - NO 24

Council Noted the Decision.

15 : WRITTEN QUESTIONS

In accordance with Council Procedure Rule 17 (f) Written Questions received for consideration together with the responses as a record in the minutes of the meeting